Mom's Christmas Morning Buttermilk Pie

3rd place Winner

2025 Meant to be Broken, Egg-specially During the Holidays Recipe Contest

Crystal Johnson* – Bedford County Fair Finalist

*"My mom made the best Buttermilk Pie in the world and always served it on Christmas morning – we didn't have much growing up, but the one thing we always had was love. I am blessed to have been taught how to bake and how to love others from watching her – this pie is dedicated to her memory."

1 piecrust for 9" pie (refrigerated, roll-out or Crystal's homemade**)

½ cup unsalted butter, melted and slightly cooled

1 ½ cups granulated sugar

4 large eggs, room temp

3 ½ T flour

1 cup buttermilk***(we used full fat in testing)

1 1/2 teas. fresh lemon zest

1 ½ T freshly squeezed lemon juice

1 teas. pure vanilla extract

1/8 teas. fine sea salt

Garnish: Powdered sugar; rosemary sprigs and cranberries or raspberries; mint, etc.



Preheat oven to 350° F. Arrange piecrust in 9" pie pan, fluting edges.

- Place melted butter in a large bowl. Blend in sugar with a whisk. Whisk in one egg at a time (don't overmix), then whisk in the flour.
- Pour in buttermilk; add zest, juice, vanilla and salt. Whisk to combine.
- Place pie crust on a baking sheet and pour the mixture into crust. Bake in oven until the edges
 are set and the center of pie has a very slight jiggle 45 50 minutes. Check halfway through
 and tent with foil to prevent overbrowning.
- Cool at least two hours. Refrigerate.
- Garnish as desired (for holiday cranberries/ for summer mint or begonia blossoms)

**Crystal's Homemade Pie Crust

1 1/4 cups flour

½ teas. salt

1/4 cup butter, cold/cubed

1/4 cup shortening

¾ teas. white vinegar and ¼ cup ice water

Mix flour and salt in a large bowl. Cut in butter and shortening, using two knives, crisscross fashion or do this in a food processor – mixture should resemble coarse sand.

Add ice water/vinegar mixture; mix until dough comes together. Roll into a flat disk. Refrigerate 2 – 3 hrs., then roll lightly on floured surface; place in pie plate; flute edges.

***No buttermilk? Add 1 tablespoon fresh lemon juice to a 1 cup measuring cup then add enough whole milk to fill to one cup. Stir together and let sit for a minimum of 15 minutes to curdle.

